

## **“Circular Road” as Good Enough Way: Learning from Indonesia in Protection of Overseas Migrant Workers in the Area of Origin**

**Susana Indriyati Caturiani\***, **Bernardus Yulianto Nugroho\*\***, **Azhar Kasim\*\*\***

\*PhD student

\*\*Lecturer at University of Indonesia

\*\*\*Professor

The Faculty of Social and Politic Science,  
University of Indonesia  
Depok, West Java, Indonesia  
Indrie02@gmail.com

### **Abstract**

*This paper examines the pre-placement governance of Indonesia Overseas Migrant Workers (OMW). The pre-placement is one part of the deployment placement cycle. The other part is placement and post-placement. In pre-placement, village is the first government institution that process them. Ideally, the government manages these migrations so that they are protected and successful. Nevertheless, the village cannot prevent OMW candidates from departing abroad without through government procedures. There is a way between ideal and not good, it is good enough way. Overseas Migrant Workers originate from Cianjur, one of the regencies in West Java Province, Indonesia. Most of them are married women and work as domestic helpers in families in Middle Eastern countries, especially Saudi Arabia. Their motivation for working abroad is to have a better life. This study is a qualitative research. Informant interview results is primary data complemented observation and utilization of related documents. Finally, this paper shows circular road for protecting migrant worker and their family.*

**Keyword:** *overseas migrant workers, governance, good enough governance, Indonesia*

### 1. INTRODUCTION

Indonesia has the largest number of overseas workers. The director of *Perlindungan WNI dan Bantuan Hukum Indonesia, Kementerian Luar Negeri* (Protection of Indonesian Citizens and Legal Enforcement, Ministry of Foreign Affairs) stated that around 80% of OIWs are lack of proper skills. Various issues on overseas workers occur during the preparation in Indonesia, in the destination country and when they come back to their home (post-migrant workers). The Government, *Perusahaan Penempatan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia Swasta (PPTKIS)* or The Agency of Private Indonesian Employment Placement (The Agency), even non-government organization agreed that the root of the problem comes from the workers' origin.

West Java is included in the top province that send the highest number of overseas workers, as shown in the following table. In 2016 and 2017 the number of migrant workers declined but in the following years increased, although it was less than the amount in 2015.

Table 1.Overseas Indonesian Workers Placement by Province

NO	PROVINCE	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
1	West Java	129,885	105,479	63,064	51,047	50,756	57,230
2	Central Java	105,971	92,591	57,078	49,512	54,737	61,434
3	East Java	93,843	78,306	48,313	43,135	63,498	70,381

*(summarized from the data of National Agency for the Placement and Protection of Indonesia Overseas Workers of the Centre for Development Research and Information or Puslitfo BNP2TKI:2019)*

The data collected from *National Agency for the Placement and Protection of Indonesia Overseas Workers* (National Agency) shows that Cianjur is the origin district with a high number of overseas workers in West Java. Table 2 indicates that it is in the top three, even though its trend decreases.

Table 2.Placement of overseas workers by district

NO	DISTRICT	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
1	Indramayu	28,410	25,521	19,025	19,025	17,685	22,114
2	Cirebon district	18,675	15,786	10,953	10,078	10,170	11,829
3	Cianjur	14,639	11,311	5,437	3,227	1,975	1,568
4	Karawang	11,749	8,499	3,907	2,749	3,098	3,586
5	Sukabumidistrict	10,577	8,665	3,660	2,250	1,928	1,818
6	Subang	10,661	8,357	7,254	6,522	7853	7,602

*(summarized from the data of Puslitfo BNP2TKI:2019)*

Even though the table shows a decrease from year to year, it does not indicate the situation on the field, because there are still people who go to work abroad without going through the government procedures.

Majority of overseas workers from this district were married women. Most of them are elementary school graduates. In 2017, the average length of education pursued by Cianjur's residents was 6.92, (<https://jabar.bps.go.id/statictable/2018/05/15/573/rata-rata-lama-sekolah-rls-provinsi-jaw7.htmla-barat-2010-201>) which implied that they were primary school graduates. Largely of them tend to choose Middle East especially Saudi Arabia as the purpose of work. In the past five years, number of high school graduates have worked as factory workers in Malaysia. Then amounts of others joined the internship program in Japan. They are facilitated by the Special Job Exchange (BKK) or Special Job Fair (SJF) held by vocational high schools for their students.

The Government of Indonesia suspends overseas workers' departure for individual users to countries in the Middle East gradually; Kuwait 2009, Jordan 2010, Syria and Saudi Arabia 2011 and Malaysia 2009. Workers migrant placement moratorium in Malaysia is then withdrawn in December 2011 based on the memorandum of understanding (MoU) that has been signed by Indonesia and Malaysia,

(<https://www.voaindonesia.com/a/moratorium-tki-ke-malaysia-dicabut-1-desember-132637553/99955.html>). The government of Indonesia has taken an action through the Decision of Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration number 260 of 2015 to stop and ban the placement of OIW's for individual users (domestic work) in 19 Middle East countries. Unfortunately, as reported by *Serikat Buruh Migran Indonesia (SBMI)* or The Unions of OIW's, as well as village officers and sponsors, the departure of overseas workers to Middle East countries still occurred even after the moratorium. This statement was supported by the result of a survey done by a NGO, Migrant Care, in Soekarno-Hatta International Airport in March-September 2015 to 1.650 domestic workers who were about to depart, more than 1.000 workers were known to use Umroh visa, short-visit visa, and their data were manipulated as workers for cleaning service. Meanwhile, out of 1.772 domestic workers who departed back to the destination country after a leave or contract renewal, 234 or them (14.5%) were from Cianjur. Battistela and Asis noted some Muslim Filipinos utilize the traditional pilgrimage to Makkah as a way of being admitted to Saudi Arabia and thereafter remain to find work. As a result, the number of irregular migrants may increase after the Haj to Makkah, when some pilgrims tend to overstay to look for an employment opportunity (Battistela & Asis, 2017).

In the context of overseas workers governance, villages can become protection sites from the beginning. Most of them come from rural areas, and they had to go through some procedure with village officers before they go to further steps. Unfortunately, village officers were lack of knowledge on this matter, moreover brokers facilitate them for working abroad. Therefore, this research aimed at understanding the governance system in overseas workers' origins in order to make suggestions and intervention to solve the problems that occur in the place of origin.

## 2. LITERATURE REVIEW

Migration is one of the activities in population mobility. Population mobility can be of two types namely vertical and horizontal. Vertical population mobility is often called a change of status, or in ordinary language, a change of fate, for example a change in employment status. Meanwhile, horizontal population mobility is also called geographical population mobility, which is the movement of the population that crosses regional boundaries into other areas within a certain period. (Mantra: 225-226).

Observing that temporary movements can also cross-national borders, the United Nations has tightened the definition of international migrants by developing the concept of long-term immigrants, including all those who arrive in a country for a year and who live there, more than one year. (Kraly and Warren in Weeks, 2015). The activity is called migration, the person who carries out the activity is called a migrant, for the country of origin emigrant and immigrant terms are used for the destination country. Accordingly, Indonesian OMW who undertake overseas employment contracts are included in the UN definition. They are those who work outside the administrative area of Indonesia, from the beginning did not intend to stay in the destination country and stay for more than one year.

The reason of migration, aside from asylum seekers and refugees, are pull and push factors. Ravenstein's conceptualization is especially related to higher wages in the destination area than in the area of origin. Rich countries that have limited labor and provides higher wages attracting people from low-income countries. At the individual level, migration is seen as an investment, through which they can improve living standards. (Weeks, 2015). Migration occurs when the future that can be achieved in the destination country is higher than the future income in the country of origin, including the cost of migration. (Vogler & Rotte, 1999). Besides the two previous factors, Lee (1966) added, *first*, the intervening obstacles that could be distance, cost, transportation, ethnicity (including religion). *Second*, personal factors related to education, knowledge of the place to be addressed also the bond of family or friends in the same village.

Mahbub Ul Haq states that the goal of development is to expand human choices (Kartasasmita, 1997; Jabeen, 2007). It means, *first*, the formation of human understanding/capability that will be reflected in improved health, knowledge and skills; *second*, using of the capabilities already possessed for work, enjoy life, or to be active in cultural, social and political activities. In the series of Human Development Reports of the United Nations Development Program (UNDP), he defined the development of terms of human development and a process of widening choices and enhancing human capabilities (Kartasasmita, 1997; Jabeen, 2007). Development needs governance, formerly only the government became an actor in governance, now there has been a shift in understanding. In recent years, the term of governance has enlisted a new meaning.

Governance now refers to new processes, methods, or ways of governing society (Stoker, 1998; Jolly, Rhodes in Jabeen, 2007). Under the new mode of governance, government is one of the actors in the process of governance along with civil society and the private sector. (O'Leary dkk,2006; Jabeen: 2007). Governing from a governance perspective is always an interactive process because it is not a single, public or private actor who has the capacity of knowledge and resources to deal with issues unilaterally (Kooiman, 1993). Governance as an interactive process involves various forms of partnership (Stoker, 1998). Bryson, Crosby and Stone define governance as a set of coordinating and monitoring activities that enables the survival of collaborative partnerships or institutions (in Emerson et al, 2011). Cheema emphasized that governance is a neutral concept, covering complex mechanisms, processes, relationships and institutions. Through this the citizens and groups articulate their interests, exercise their rights and obligations and mediate / manage their differences. (Cheema, 2005). Governance concept can be applied to every type of collective action; global, national, institution and community scope. (Graham et al. 2003). According to Sammers and Collyer (2017), in the context of migration governance point to the process by which migration and other social processes are governed. It means controlled, enforced, promoted, or extenuated by various 'levels' of government. these levels can be based geographically. (i.e. international, national, regional, local, and so forth) or functionally. For example, various organizations with different functions can be entangled in regulatin migration.

Governance in the sense of management of development arranged not only by the government but open citizen participation is an idea that has been practiced in many countries. Governance presupposes the stakeholders involved. This interaction process is possible in form of coordination; they help each other in their own way. In terms of coordination, they can share the information, make a direction, discuss the schedule, inform each activity in the bulletin and make a compromise since the beginning. Moreover, it is also possible in form of cooperative which is the effort and joint association for mutual benefits. In the event of cooperation, they help each other with more specific way. During this stage, several institutions can provide a different service for society, started from developing community and fulfilling needs and developing the sense of trusting each other and seeing the better way of doing something. The following is the colworkersation which means working together with other parties for mutual benefit which cannot be achieved if working alone. At this stage, planning and evaluation are done together and so do the resources fusion. (Forest, 2003).

According to Jabeen (2007) governance is a cultural phenomenon. Culture is defined as shared values of the people living in a country or region. It reflects that in the implementation of cultural values and morals need to be enforced. Cultural values are not only limited to the values that are put into certain formal regulations or procedure, but they also include the ones that apply in the daily life within a certain society. In the 1992 the World Bank raised the definition of good governance as the manner in which power is exercised in the management of a country's economic and social resources for development. (IFAD, 1999). The essence of the good governance according to the World Bank is the presence of open policy, professional bureaucracy, and accountable executives within certain united, participative, and law-obedient society (IFAD, 1999). Later on, UNDP provides good governance characteristics as follow (1) Participation, men and women must have voice in the direct decision-making process or through official institution representing their interest (2) Rule of Law (3) Transparency (4) responsiveness, institution and process have to service all parties (5) Agreement-oriented (6) Equity (7) Effective and efficient (the best use) (8) Accountability (9) Strategic (Rondinelli, 2006).

Grindle stated that the implementation of governance for developing countries as intended by donor agencies and developed countries is generally too far to be achieved (2004). Those problems are generally encountered by developing countries in their attempts to reach the ideal procedure, which lead to some other suggestions; good enough governance (Gindle,2004), or by the term Rodrick, second best institution (2006), or stepwise governance (Kim, 2010). Through a historic perspective, in the past, well-developed countr is also went through some steps to reach today's condition. Therefore, it is impossible for the developing countries to jump over some steps to the top. (Chang, 2002). Good enough governance refers to the minimum state of government performance and favorable participation from the society that initiate new insights on the anti-poverty program instead of giving negative effects to both economic development and politics. Furthermore, Grindle explained that problems cannot be solved at once since an institution has limited capacity though certain process that takes time (Grindle, 2007). GEG agenda should involve the government in order to allow political procedure in running the program, considering the dynamic political state in the

developing countries. The real action that gives immediate effect should be taken as a part of a long-term plan. The realization of certain plan requires participation from other parties as a support for the sustainability program. Another important point to note is the need to maintain the programs on the run. Even though the program is not yet ideal, explanation on the obstacles and the factors that support the program are important for the future plan and betterment of the program.

### **3. METHODS**

This is a qualitative study which data were obtained through interviews and observations. The informants were the employees of Cianjur Local Government; Manpower and Transmigration Office (MT Office), Community and Village Empowerment Office (COMVILE Office), Women Empowerment, The Protection of Children and Family Planning Office (WEPCFP Office), Village officers, and chairman of the special job market at vocational high schools. In addition, non-governmental organization including the Unions of OIWs in Cianjur, association of ex-migrant, and Trade Union of Moslem Indonesian (Sarbumusi). Besides, brokers and regional privat agency were also included as informants of this study. The observation was done in the service center of Manpower and Transmigration Office.

### **4. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

The issue of overseas migrant workers is a dilemma. In Indonesia, job availability and job opportunity are still low. Meanwhile, in Middle East countries jobs are widely available. Job opportunities that do not require high diplomas, high skills with relatively large salaries have helped many people fulfill the needs of the family economy, not even a few who are able to do social mobility. However, the issues that espouse the activity are not simple, either related to the process of obtaining the job, the problem in the destination country, and also the management of remittances and family resilience. After almost two years working in the United Arab Emirates, an overseas worker went home to her country to process her divorce since her husband used the money she sent to marry again. After she finished all that, she went to work again. This problem frequently happened. Commonly, their children moved to the wife's side. The government only records prospective overseas workers who register legally through the MT Office and the data shows the tendency of the number of migrant workers to decline (Tabel 2). According to Head of Employment Placement and Work Extension Division, MT Office, the decrease might be resulted from the moratorium on the worker placement to Middle East countries and the growth of some factories in Cianjur. The vast majority was women and men in 19-32 years old processing job seeker card (or yellow card) with the purpose of applying for a job in many factories in Cianjur, surrounding districts like Sukabumi, Bogor, Bandung, and Bekasi. They were junior or senior high school graduates. Then, Sukabumi Immigration Office, a place to serve society's passport process domiciled in Sukabumi and Cianjur district explained that they have processed passport in accordance with the standard operational procedure, including in terms of interviewing those who would work abroad without having a working license.

The head of immigration information and communication sections stated that illegal cases of overseas workers' passport coming from Cianjur or Sukabumi were not sure issued by Sukabumi Immigration Office since they could make it in another immigration office in West Java Province according to the agency. However, the deployment of migrant workers to Saudi Arabia was still occurring. According to the immigration data, during the moratorium application, workers worker illegally going to the Middle East was about 2600 on average, (<http://nasional.kompas.com/read/2017/09/16/06573551/bnp2tki-rumuskan-format-baru-pengiriman-tki-ke-timur-tengah>). That was also supported by the interview result with a broker, chief of a hamlet and the head of women's empowerment section that OIWs recruitment on the field was still going on. An official in WEPCFP Office proposed that there was a case improvement of human trafficking, last year was seven cases and until August 2017 increasing to 17 cases. This increase is related to the OIWs departure. The Head of Advocation Division of Integrated Service Center for Empowering Women and Children condoned that matter. (<http://indosuara.com/is-news/berita-indonesia/modus-pengiriman-tki-padahal-jual-manusia-di-cianjur/>).

The head of MT office proposed that she only handled OIWs following the government procedure, out of that was not her authority. Generally, Middle East becomes a favorite place for overseas workers from Cianjur because, in addition to the religion similarity, it did not need a lot of requirements and a long time to wait. Moreover, in an interview with one of the union heads, it was proposed an idea to withdraw

moratorium regulation of workers to the Saudi Arabia and Cianjur was proposed to be a pilot project of OIWs' delivery which was in accordance with procedure. From the broker/sponsorship side, it would be more profitable and easier. The following table indicates the number of migrant workers from Cianjur going abroad to work through the regional office of manpower and transmigration department.

Table 3. The Placement of Overseas Indonesian Workers

No.	Destination Countries	2012-2017
1	United Arab Emirates	7,458
2	Oman	5,728
3	Saudi Arabia	3,321
4	Malaysia	1,854
5	Qatar	1,723
6	Bahrain	1,684
7	Singapura	721
8	Taiwan	591
9	Hong Kong	232
10	Brunei Darussalam	194

*(summarized from the data of district MT Office: 2017)*

Starting from 2015, going to the Middle East was not overseas workers' first experience since they were those extending the working contract, even though their contract has frequently been ended. It has become a common thing if they worked in the United Arab Emirates for years with a prolonged contract. Later on, new overseas workers were able to get a formal job as that sector was not included in the moratorium because the employer of the formal sector was a company, not an individual. The head of the employment section stated that some workers applied as workers for formal sectors to Saudi Arabia which allow primary school graduates to work for this sector. While they access the online system for the registration, there were some domestic jobs available that they could register to, making it impossible for this MT Office to cancel the registration process. On the other side, similar jobs in Indonesia require the applicants to possess the minimum education of junior high school level. This situation brings a question, what kinds of formal job that only require elementary school education and have no skill ability?

From the interview with a broker, it was known that OIWs still doing domestically works but they did not live in their boss' house but in private agency's house where they were bound by working contract. The broker said that this kind of model was safer for OIWs than they live in their boss' house. That was similar the opinion conveyed by The Head of BNP2TKI that the draft of the new format for Middle East placement would differ between employer and the director. The working contract was between OIWs and union or agency. They could also work in one-more-than-place in a day or eight working hours. They also have a choice to not live in their boss' house. (<http://nasional.kompas.com/read/2017/09/16/06573551/bnp2tki-rumuskan-format-baru-pengiriman-tki-ke-timur-tengah>). This kind of practice was similar the outsource which was also occurring in Indonesia, not to mention a company providing cleaning service for hospital, apartment, office etc. Sponsors or brokers have been playing dominant role in the enrollment process. These brokers might be the employees of the agency itself, or they might be other people who hold the letters from agency anyone. Commonly the candidate of OIWs knew the brokers since generally, they were still relatives both neighbors and even husband. Brokers seem to be one of problems in this issue for some of them were caught providing false information to the applicants, and they also falsified some documents. On the contrary, for job applicants, brokers are regarded helpful. A study in Lombok, found that private agencies depend on these informal brokers who recruit migrants in villages. (Lindquist, 2012). The secretary of the Association of Private Indonesia Employment Placement Agencies of West Java Province proposed that once an agency has a branch office, they must cooperate with the local sponsorship since the district areas commonly have been divided. As a result, agency staff could not easily conduct recruitment to villages. The duty of agency staff especially managed the documents of OIWs candidate in MT office and Immigration office. Various limitations of OIWs candidate causes them not registering themselves to agency branch office or MT Office. The limitation faced,

in addition to the lack of understanding of the procedure of document processing was the distance between their house and MT Office or agency office which far and the cost which was not cheap. Sponsorship/brokers were the way for OIW candidate both procedural and not procedural. So far, brokers still have an important role in recruiting prospective overseas workers in the villages.

For the government, a broker was one of the problems since they could be anyone, not only agency staff so that MT Office was not able to monitor them. However, it could be an illegal source of income for government individual since document processing was not fully free. The Head of MT Office who served since the beginning of 2017 said that one of his jobs is to eradicate illegal levies in the processing of workers documents that occurred in his office. However, according to the regional secretary of the agency, those charges were still occurring. For agency, a double-faced broker became a part of cost but in another side s/he caused an agency has a candidate of overseas workers. Some of the agencies also considered that the broker helped society to have a document since generally villagers did not pay attention the importance of citizenship document. Being a candidate for overseas workers obligated them to have citizenship document. The broker commonly gave not complete information about the job vacancy, including helping them through a not-procedural way, but according to the candidate of overseas workers, the broker worked together to process the document because even though it was a service it was not completely free. Brokers' fee of OIW with Taiwan, Hongkong and Singapore placement was gotten from their salary which will be calculated. Meanwhile, those whose placement was in the United Arab Emirates, the cost was certified by the employer. This relationship established between the broker and overseas workers was unique. When they attended training in the training center or lived in settlement houses, the broker visits his/her "children". Commonly, they were accommodated and trained in Jakarta, 103 kilometers away from Cianjur or surrounding areas like Bekasi whose distance is about 111 kilometers from Cianjur. When they encountered in the settlement house, the candidates were not disinclined to ask for being treated or being bought a personal need like soap, sanitary napkins etc. Frequently, the family in the village entrusted food too. The availability of brokers to not only manage the document but also serve the candidates was part of the service business. If that broker was extravagant to them, they implicitly have advertised themselves. The role of brokers in serving the candidate of overseas workers was hard to be changed by the government.

There are some aspects that make the number of migrant workers high, especially to the Middle East, such as the low income that can be earned in the rural areas and factories set the minimum requirement of junior high school graduates, high school graduates or certain age limit. As proposed by ex-Saudi's overseas workers that working in the village only fulfills the needs for food but not the other needs which were more than that. Meanwhile, the result gotten from working in the Saudi Arabia could be used to build a house. In addition, some workers avoid seeking for jobs in Southeast Asia countries or East Asia due to the complexity of the registration process and requirement. Besides, the remittance cut off from Asia countries is considered too high. Moreover, the employees of agency and the brokers are not enthusiastic in placing workers to Asia countries due to high expense, and brokers earn more profit when they are able to send workers to the Middle East countries. Currently, MT office requires the candidate of overseas workers to submit 16 documents to get a recommendation and ID number. Those requirements include personal documents of the candidate, broker legality and the agency including the reality of the job order. They argued that those requirements were the effort to avoid document adulteration and OIW candidate protection. This requirement encumbers agency but because every district has an autonomy, at the end of the time they try to meet the requirements. Such a protection which was also conducted was during the interview at MT Office, the candidates who have married must be accompanied by his husband and the ones who were still single partnered by their parents. Then, if still having an under-five-child, the candidates are suggested to not go. Since the beginning of 2017, those who were eligible to conduct interview were the head of the office, secretary and the head of the division.

In addition to the information from the broker, people from Cianjur might also have certain job information from the Middle East countries because their colleagues or families are working there. The interview has been conducted then revealed that the initial reason why the Cianjur people went to the Saudi Arabia was that they want to learn Islam there. Most of them come from Islamic boarding house. Moreover, the landladies where the students live need a housekeeper so that the students invited their relatives or neighbor to work in the Saudi Arabia. Then, not to mention a mother who has been working in the Saudi Arabia let her daughter work for the same boss. As time goes by the networking or path was formed until

becoming a tradition. When the moratorium was applied; such a matter was still going on. From the Middle East countries' side as the receiving countries, the Executive Director of Migrant Care stated that the moratorium should be discussed by both parties. In fact, they still issue workers' visa. It is also supported by a broker that Saudi Arabia still issues workers' visa, and there even have some people who are willing to take care of the workers who do not possess the work visa.

Out of those reasons explained above, migrants from Cianjur prefer working in Middle East, especially Saudi Arabia, to countries in Southeast Asia nor East Asia put the religion aspect as a major consideration. If deciding to work in Southeast Asia or East Asia, they were afraid to be asked to do a job which was not in accordance with their religion, such as cooking pork, caring a dog, or having a difficulty in performing payer or fasting and have to be careful towards foods in relation to the halal standard. Those possibilities become one of the things considered in an interview in MT Office, in addition to the possibility of family problem arise. In opposite in the Middle East, *first*, moslems see Saudi Arabia as a holy place and they have expectation to go Umrah or Hajj during their stay. *Second*, the households are considered appropriate with their faith. *Third*, the foods are halal. In the other side, a former migrant worker highlighted that working as domestic workers in Middle East (including Saudi Arabia) is a gamble since there is an equal possibility to meet either good or ill-mannered employers. This statement becomes the fourth reason, in which when workers meet good employers, they do not necessarily deal with others document processing than passport. Moreover, a good boss frequently still sends money to the migrant workers event though they have come back to Indonesia. That was experienced by one of the ex-Saudi's overseas workers who were a widower. Her ex-boss helps him to fund her second child to finish his/her senior high school. Those value-based reasons cannot be simply changed by issuing certain regulation nor short-term socialization on safe migration.

The motivation of migrant workers in working overseas is to get a more proper life. In order to have a better life, and even they took the risk to take the illegal way by help of the broker. When their status was illegal, they get much more income. Based on a study on the illegal migration to Malaysia, the term 'illegal' is equal to the deliberation of resisting a coercive system (Killias,2010) because legal system is not considered better, for instance the system on employment contract. Before moratorium policy was applied, migrant workers placement in the area of Middle East was legal, but then that official characteristic did not guarantee working balance and the safety of the migrant workers. When encountered with so many bad accidents like violence, sickness, or death and etc, they answer, "it is their fate, we can face a different fate which is good or Insha Allah that will not happen to us." They do not have many choices to change their life. However, there is also the candidate who go abroad because of escaping from the problem within their family.

Generally, they use the remittance to build their houses, so that bringing a term of a house of "Arab", for the education fare of their children, health care, and for investment on properties. However, sometimes this target could not be achieved due to inability of the family in managing the remittance and due to the lack of financial literacy knowledge given by government. Remittance beneficial commonly becomes a problem in a family; husband-wife conflict, parent-in-law and children-in-law conflict, the husband married again, buying stuff that was not important yet for children like a smart phone for children in elementary school and etc. Migrant workers's children caring was abandoned since the family member, husband or parents were not able to care the children left. Village officers are reluctant to tap on this issue because they are afraid of getting too much involved in someone else's personal affair. Hence, village officers are unable to do their role as society advisors. In addition, village government agencies did not completely understand yet the issue of migrant workers. With the reason of the lack of budget, MT Office did not periodically hold a socialization on workers migrant to the village government agency. Information sent through a letter, for example, was information about moratorium of migrant worker placement to 19 countries in the area of Middle East. COMVILE Office as a party has a duty to nurture the village government agency considered that migrant workers issue was the obligation of MT Office. Then, civil society as one of the parties in governance was not involved significantly yet. A local non-government organization cannot be strength yet in the community since the human resource was limited and not financially independent. Meanwhile, Islamic institution or organization could not be invited yet to work hand in hand in managing overseas workers issue so do the educational institution.

Those problems require massive intervention in each part of the placemant cycle. Likewise it should be at every level of government and the parties, then also improvements in the soft aspect; values, norms embodied in policies and hard aspects, namely the establishment of institutions that focus on managing OIW's



issues. It is emphasized by Grindle that fixing these problems entail high budget and high-quality human resources which might be considered demanding for developing countries. She also highlighted it takes relatively long time to solve those problems and they cannot be simply solved at once. Therefore, interventions should be made periodically or possibly done.

The local government maintained the principle of autonomy in conducting government problem in the regional area. Thereinafter, Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Local Government also give authority of migrant workers protection to the local government as written in Subdivision of Workers placement, letter d. Indonesia worker protection in abroad (pre and post placement in the district/city area. (The Attachment of the Distribution of Concurrent Governmental Affairs between Central Government and provincial and District/City government, letter G. Distribution of Governmental Affairs of Worker Division). As a result, the local government has an authority to make an action in terms of OIWs governance. Then also the Law Number 6 of 2017 on The Village consider that in the course of constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, the village has developed in various forms that need to be protected and empowered in order to be powerful, advanced, independent, and democratic so as to create a solid foundation in implementing governance and development towards a just, prosperous, and prosper society. Regarding the Law regulating OIWs, the new Law passed in 2017 regulated that the village government was actively involved in the migration governance while in 2004 did not. From the side of policy norm, there has been an improvement, however; application guideline in terms of technical regulation still needs time to make that Law can be fully applied.

#### 4.1 Best Practices

Within GEG, it is important to learn from well-enough small things and understand their strengths and weaknesses. There have been two programs that should be considered. The *first*, local government has a specific program named *Cianjur Ngawangun Lembang* or Cianjur Works for the Village which is run by the Regent, targeting 100 villages in a year. The program allows leaders to do face-to-face communication in the field by visiting 2 to 4 villages within 1-2 days. Offices which hold public service duties are able to offer services during the visit, not to mention the issuance of the birth certificate, family card, ID card, card for job seekers and licensing, and then healthy service for under five children, maternity, elderly and contraception application. Usually, orphans and senior citizens are given some donation, and the officers also monitor the progress of occasion, the regent was asked to inaugurate the organization committee of the village or sub-district level, not to mention the associations of young mosque activist, and prosperity Council of Mosque. One of the activities in this program was making society have a citizenship document because it can be preliminary for a protection effort.

Cianjur Works for the Villages program needs to be extended through, *firstly*, the local government agencies of the village where the migrant worker comes should conduct a socialization on the safe migration. *Secondly*, training a group of ex-OIWs to be a cadre who partnered with the local government in avoiding improper migration procedures. *Thirdly*, the safe poster placement on migration was at all village or sub-district halls. *Fourthly*, making a pilot village of OIWs who within include; safe migration, remittance management, migrant family accompaniment and economic activity of ex-OIWs.

The *second* program is a program namely Special Job Bourse (SJB) in Vocational High School. (<http://bkk.ditpsmk.net/about>). This SJB runs actively in two sub districts and both are public Vocational High Schools. The schools have successfully sent their alumni to work in Malaysia and Japan as OIWs in formal sectors. Through this program, the students are given chances to get recruited and work for companies. The schools have signed a deal with non-government overseas worker placement agency to help the schools preparing their students to fulfill the requirement as overseas workers to work in various countries. One of the SMKs was exploring a work chance for boy students in an International airport in Qatar. The positive side of this program was, *firstly*, educational background of OIWs candidate has been higher than before, that was senior high school, through high education they were expected to have a better skill. *Secondly*, the type of the job explored was a formal sector. It did not mean that this sector had no - problem but the employer and the regulation applied was clearer. *Thirdly*, private agency as the job order holder has been selected by the school, it was expected that the act of fraud and neglect can be avoided. *Fourthly*, if something happened to OIWs on the host country, it would be easier to the family or government to track in the origin area as it can ask the related SMK. *Fifthly*, the process taken was following the government procedure. *Sixthly*, minimizing family problem like marital problem and children accompaniment since they went abroad to work with a

single status. One of the men OIWs used his remittance to continue his study at university. But then, there was something which needs improvement that was the addition of debriefing on the good workers migrant. They have departed in accordance with procedure, but because the unknown they can be an illegal worker someday. Later, the thing should be monitored was the cost, especially those following internship program to Japan since it was G to G program.

Those programs should replicate or inspire other schools in Cianjur District to create similar programs or SMKs having not an access yet towards various resources allowed to follow the placement process in the SMK whose SJB was active while the manager learned the management. This cooperation must be facilitated by MT Offices and Education Office. Neighboring entity success (country, district, school and etc) was more relevant to be emulated or created a benchmark, compared to refer to the success story happened in a far place. This aimed to shorten an idea and realistic gap in terms of improvement. (Kim, 2010).

#### 4.2 Cooperation among Government Institutions

Overseas migrant workers governance issue needs cooperation among the local government organization. In order to start cooperation, they must to make a discussion, to understand a joint issue and to commit helping each other in solving that problem. This cooperation was expected to bring the sense of trust each other, which was one of the important aspects of having a deeper relationship which is colworkersation.

Establishing a new platform meant requiring a budget. For that matter, it was better to optimize the existing various cooperative organization, *firstly*, Integrated Service Center for Empowering Women and Children in district or sub-district level, consisting structural and non-structural coming from the circle of the profession, academics, and public figure. As one of the forms of the integrated service unit, Integrated Service Center for Empowering Women and Children functions as the center of information for women and children; service center for women and violence victim; and empowerment center for women and children. The activity was among others socialization on human trafficking and violence victim handling. (The Regulation of The Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Numbr 6 of 2015 Concerning Women's Empowerment and Child Protection System). *Secondly*, Operational Working Group (OWG) in district or sub-district level which accompanies center(s) of Pos Family Planning Services - Integrated Health(IH) conducted in villages. District OWG's duty and function were among others preparing and analyzing the development data of IH program and communicating it to other parties, arranging annual activities, nurturing IH and facilitating efforts helping it improvement. OWG of IH management comes from the government organization/institution, professional institution, university, non-government organization, business world having a relationship in the establishment/management of IH and society. IH is the Community-Based Health Effort (CBHE) which is now not only serve the needs of public health. IH can develop or expand activities that is selected and tailored to the need local community. The head of division in COMVILE Office stated that currently, IH has a different way. They apply Holistic Integrative (HI) approaches, as described is flexible, developed according to the needs, concerns and resource capabilities. Thus, the region has the opportunity to provide services according to the needs or local issues. IH Team of West Java Province outlines the activities of basic social services in the province among others Early Childhood Education programs (ECD); family development for toddler, teenager, elderly; Increasing the Family Economic; Empowerment of Poor and person with social welfare problems. This program was essential to accompany children and OIWs' family member when they go abroad to work. *Thirdly*, Women Empowerment, The Protection of Children and Family Planning Office held foster family program for OIWs'. There were three programs within or the step of OIWs' family economy empowerment, durability and OIWs' family prosperity improvement and the fulfillment of OIWs children right. In terms of the application, the regional office coordinates with other regional offices, for example, agricultural and livestock regional office and the regional office of trade and small-scale enterprise in performing OIWs' family economy empowerment.

In addition, Education and Culture Office (ECO) also holds the responsibility to educate the children up to the senior high school level about save migration, so that grows stronger awareness on migrant workers issues. Moreover, children in Cianjur which is an area with the highest number of migrant workers might be easily exposed to migrant issues. Therefore, the education system should include this theme in the local-content subjects in order to provide children with appropriate information on the matter. The interview result with one of the heads of Sections in ECO, when he was in charge at one of the villages, there was a

learning center conducting an activity to give material about OIWs, but not sustainable. GEG should be highly motivated in performing their job, to make small change even if it cannot yet reach the ideal state.

#### 4.3 *The Involvement of Non-Government Parties*

One of the weaknesses of the government program implementation was its sustainability, whereas there were unfinished programs only at a single activity. One of the examples was providing entrepreneurship training for ex-migrant workers; they learn how to produce sellable things. As a beginner, they really need accompaniment to maintain the quality, manage the business financial and being helped to market and access to capitalization source. That matter has a lack of attention. The local government could establish cooperation with other parties to make the program continued. Involving the overseas workers community is the main requirement. Despite of their low education level, their experiences in working abroad are worth noticing. Some of the OIWs finally pursue higher education level through equality programs such as Package B (equivalent to junior high school) and C (equivalent to high school) held by EC Office, and then become a staff in a village hall. Some overseas workers have come back to Indonesia and have become businessman in their origins. They should be involved as leaders or agents to grow society's awareness and empowerment on the matter. They should be recruited as members of village boards that they are able to take part in designing certain policies on the matter in the village. They should also participate as members of non-government organization in the national scale. By joining the organization, they could extend their network and access to various resources. The empowerment program should involve ex OIWs by creating certain communities in their place of origin. In GEG, government can never achieve goals by the work of the governments themselves. Government also deals with mainstream limitations and problems faced by developing countries. The participation of social communities also is the key to grow the sense of belonging and to improve self-esteem. Eventually, the strong and sustainable community can be created. (Siri & Chantraprayoon, 2017).

Another social group that should be involved in this program is the group of religion leaders. Regarding to the fact that migrant workers prefer working in Saudi Arabia to Asia because they have certain motivation related to religion. Jabeen named this phenomenon as values in action which refers to the values which are kept alive and being practiced by certain society. In this context, intervention cannot be made by implementing certain regulations only. Generally, people from Cianjur are not nomads since Cianjur has fertile land and enough supply of water which allow the society to work in agriculture sector. Furthermore, the majority people are moslems, and the males always go to the mosque for Friday prayers, while the females are members of Islamic Study groups. This makes religion leaders hold a huge chance to educate the society about working as overseas workers and its relations with Islamic and cultural values.

The institution that also must be the partner of the cooperation was university. Geographically, Cianjur district was relatively near to various private or state universities in Bogor, Jakarta and Bandung. Universities in Indonesia have Research Institute and Community Service Agency which makes it as an assistance program. Under the program of Cianjur Works for the Villages, the field of agriculture, fisheries and agro tourism could be developed with the support of research and accompaniment from university. That was the quality of resources improvement or Ex-OIWs and society in general. The location of Cianjur which was close to city and has a cool weather makes it one of the tourism destinations in weekend. The result of agriculture and fisheries would be absorbed by society in Jakarta and Bandung. The improvement of those fields can be conducted by community-based in order to make its benefit wider, the sense of belonging increases and the most important thing is the sustainability maintained. By improving this sector, their income would be also improved.

The national level of Non-Government Organizations has an experience and ability to educate and train the candidate so that qualified and reliable. For that matter, the NGO could be a partner in the program of education, training, and cadre.

The private sector was the next party which was invited to work together. Bank was an important party in the event of economic empowerment, in addition to capitalization access; it also gives financial literacy education. There was one example of the activity that has been conducted by a business group of a retailer, that was providing training of the second-hand goods benefiting to the women around their outlet. They said that this activity could be a form of Corporate Social Responsibility. This kind of company can be a partner since their outlet was spread until sub-districts. This pattern can be followed by other companies.

The government of Cianjur may also learn from other districts that have been successfully implemented good management of agriculture sector, agro-tourism sector such as the establishment of Village-Owned Business Institution that has given a significant contribution in the village development.

## **5. CONCLUSION**

Ideally, placement governance improvement of overseas workers should be conducted in every part of the cycle, in every level of government, including the soft aspects; value, established the norm in various policies and hard aspect appeared within the institutions, as well as the existence of colworkersation with non-government organizations. As the consequence, that action needs strong political desire and commitment of every party to colworkersate and it is not small cost. That simultaneity is difficult to be applied in a developing country. For that matter, the improvement was conducted in village and district level. The choice is made since it still possible politically and directly involves subject i.e. ex-OIWs and their family. Moreover, a village is the origin and the end destination of migrant workers.

Starting an improvement by benefiting an ongoing-good-program is also part of realizing improvement effort and working on a success. Even though that program needs a long time to be finished, yet it is a real and participative implementation so that the better improvement can sustain and fundamental. This is a circular road that must be beaten to give protection for migrant workers also their family and to optimize the result of their migration.

## **Acknowledgment**

This study is funded by the doctorate funding program of The Ministry of Education and Culture, Indonesia.

## References

- [1]. Chang, H. J. (2002). *Kicking Away the Ladder: Development Strategy in Historical Perspective*. London: Anthem Press.
- [2]. Cheema, G. Shabbir. (2005). *Governance and Development in Building Democratic Institutions: Governance Reform in Developing Countries*. Bloomfield USA. Kumarian Press.
- [3]. Emerson, Kirk. Tina Nabatchi. Stephen Balogh.(2011). An Integrative Framework for Collaborative Governance. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*. May 2.1-30
- [4]. Grindle, M. S. (2004). Good Enough Governance: Poverty Reduction and Reform in Developing Countries. *Governance: An International Journal of Policy, Administration, and Institutions*, 17(4), 525–548.
- [5]. Grindle, M. S. (2007). Good Enough Governance Revisited. *Development Policy Review*, 25 (5): 553-574.
- [6]. International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD). (1999). *Good Governance: An Overview*, Executive Board – Sixty-Seventh Session, Rome, 8-9 September.
- [7]. Jabeen, N. (2007). *Good or Good Enough Governance in South Asia: Constrain and Possibilities*. Inaugural Address. Utrecht University.
- [8]. Kartasasmita, G. (1997). *Administrasi Pembangunan: Perkembangan, Pemikiran, dan Praktiknya di Indonesia*. Jakarta: LP3ES.
- [9]. Killias, O. (2010). 'Illegal' Migration as Resistance: Legality, Morality and Coercion in Indonesian Domestic Worker Migration to Malaysia. *Asian Journal of Social Science*, 38, 897–914.
- [10]. Lee, Everett S. (1966) *A Theory of Migration*. *Demography*, Vol. 3, No. 1., pp. 47-57.
- [11]. Stable URL:<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0070-3370%281966%293%3A1%3C47%3AATOM%3E2.0.CO%3B2-B>
- [12]. Mantra, Ida Bagoes(2007). *Demografi Umum*. Jakarta.PustakaPelajar.
- [13]. Pan, S. K. (2010). Building Trust by Improving Governance: Searching for a Feasible Way for Developing Countries. *Public Administration Quarterly*, 34 (3), 271-299.
- [14]. Kooiman, J. (2003). *Governing as Governance*. California: SAGE Publications.
- [15]. Lindquist, J. (2012). The Elementary School Teacher, the Thug and his Grandmother: Informal Brokers and Transnational Migration from Indonesia. *Pacific Affairs*, 85(1), 69-89. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.5509/201285169>.
- [16]. O'Leary, R., Lisa B. B., & Catherine G. (2006). Introduction to the Symposium on Colworkersative Public Management. *Public Administration Review* 66, 6–9.
- [17]. Rodrik, D. (2008). Second-Best Institutions. *American Economic Review*, 100-104.
- [18]. Rotte, Ralph & Michael Vogler. (1999). *The Effects of Development on Migration: Theoretical Issues and New Empirical Evidence*. Discussion Paper No. 46, June. Bonn. The Institute for the Study of Labor (IZA).
- [19]. Samers, Michael & Michael Collyer.(2017). *Migration*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Routledge.
- [20]. Siri, R. & Onjana S. C. (2017). *Local Community Participatory Learning with a Nature Interpretation System: A Case Study in Ban Pong, Sansai District, Chiang Mai, Thailand*. *Kasetsart Journal of Sosial Sciences*, 38, 181-185.
- [21]. Stoker, G. (1998). *Governance as Theory: five propositions*. UNESCO. UK: Blackwell Publisher.
- [22]. Weeks, John R. (2015). *Population: An Introduction to Concepts and Issues*. Cengage Learning.
- [23]. Law Number 23 of 2014 Concerning Local Government
- [24]. Law Number 6 of 2014 Concerning Village
- [25]. The Regulation of The Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Numbr 6 of 2015 Concerning Women's Empowerment and Child Protection System
- [26]. <https://jabar.bps.go.id/statictable/2018/05/15/573/rata-rata-lama-sekolah-rls-provinsi-jaw7.htmla-barat-2010-201>
- [27]. <https://www.voaindonesia.com/a/moratorium-tki-ke-malaysia-dicabut-1-desember-132637553/99955.html>
- [28]. <http://nasional.kompas.com/read/2017/09/16/06573551/bnp2tki-rumuskan-format-baru-pengiriman-tki-ke-timur-tengah>.
- [29]. <http://bkk.ditpsmk.net/about>