Teacher Mentoring: Problems and Solutions

1Ridwan Ridwan, 2Dedy H. Karwan, 3Hasan Hariri

1SMP Negeri 3 Way Pengubuan, Lampung Tengah, Lampung, Indonesia
2Fakultas Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan, Universitas Lampung, Indonesia
Jl. Prof. Dr. Soemantri Brojonegoro No. 1 Bandar Lampung, Indonesia.
*Corresponding e-mail: riadanrosidimuawi@gmail.com

Received: 7 Juni 2020 Accepted: 9 Juni 2020 Online Published: 8 Juli 2020

Abstract: Teacher mentoring: problems and solutions. Purpose: This paper aims to find answers to research questions: 1) what problems do teachers face? 2) How can mentoring overcome the problems? Method: The authors applied action research Margaret Riel's model which consists of studying and planning, taking action, collecting and analyzing evidence, and reflecting. The authors used the following instruments to collect the data: a) observation format sheet, b) flanders format sheet, c) camera, and 4) five-step format accompaniment. There are four teachers as participants involved in this research. Findings: 1) Teachers faced pedagogical, personality, social, and professional competences. 2) These problems could be solved using mentoring through the ability of mentors in playing the roles of facilitators to produce a good relationship between mentor and mentees.

Keywords: relationships, mentoring, effective teacher
INTRODUCTION

The future of a nation is in the hands of teachers. Abundant natural resources are not maximally beneficial in the hands of unqualified human resources. Conversely, a lot of human resources will become a burden of development. Quality human resources start from quality education, and quality education is in the hands of qualified teachers. Indonesia has around 4 million teachers, more than 60 million students in 340,000 educational institutions. Indonesia occupies the third-largest in the Asian region and the fourth largest in the world after the People's Republic of China, India and the United States. Two ministries are responsible for managing the education system in Indonesia, 84% of schools are under the Ministry of Education and Culture and 16% under the Ministry of Religion (OECD, 2015).

The teacher is an important subsystem that has a strategic role in improving the learning process and student quality (Menegpan RB, 2009). Darling-Hammond's (1999) research results, prove that the teacher is the main factor that is able to influence the success of student learning compared to parents and economic aspects though. In other words, the quality of education can only be sought by professional teachers. Professional teachers must meet four competencies, namely; 1) Pedagogic Competency, 2) Personality Competency, 2) Social Competency, and 4) Professional Competency.

Teachers' pedagogical skills truly determine students' academic performance and determine effective classroom management (Khojastehmehr & Takrimi, 2009). Students learn more than teachers with characteristics of skills, such as mastery of the materials, know-how to design and deliver for diverse classes effectively (Wayne & Youngs, 2003). Pedagogic factors influence teacher and student performance. Pedagogical abilities have a reciprocal relationship with classroom management and student academic performance including assessment and assessment skills, mastery of Information Technology, and co-curricular knowledge (Chetty, Friedman, & Rockoff, 2014).

The ability to manage classes and control student behavior is a prerequisite for becoming an effective teacher. Teachers who have the ability to organize and manage student behavior will produce positive education graduates (Oliver & Reschly, 2007). Effective teachers are able to minimize classroom disruptive student behavior (Emmer & Stough, 2001). Students involved in the learning process show fewer behavioral problems and are more involved in responding and correcting responses (Conroy, Sutherland, Snyder, & Marsh, 2008). Thus, healthy competition will occur. Healthy competition strengthens leadership and beneficial understanding between losers and winners (Hamid et al., 2012). The effectiveness of learning was influenced by the setting of the application of the collaborative learning environment method so that there was a dramatic increase in the student level by teachers who changed the classroom environment each semester (Zapatero, Maheshwari, & Chen, 2012). The main factors that motivate students to learn from their perspective are the teacher's personality, teaching methodology, positive classroom management (Halawah, 2011).

In the Indonesian perspective, it is included in the pedagogical competence sourced from the Director-General of the Quality Assurance of Educators and Education Personnel Depdiknas are (1) Mastering the characteristics of students, (2) Mastering learning theories and learning principles that educate, (3) Curriculum Development, (4) Educating learning activities, (5) Development of potential students, (6) Communication with students, (7) Assessment and evaluation (Permen, 2009).
There are still many teachers who have not been able to meet the requirements to become effective teachers. For this and other reasons, efforts are needed, particularly mentoring. Mentoring activities are mutual learning activities because the focus of mentoring is to help improve teachers’ ability to manage learning. Mentoring activities can be carried out by supervisors and principals, or between peer-teachers. Accompanying teachers have the greatest influence on the development of professional teachers. This responsibility is a very significant responsibility. Knowledge, time, and involvement are needed to create meaningful experiences for the mentored teacher. Providing a climate of openness, honest discussion, questions, and attention will create an environment that allows reflection and development for the mentors and who are assisted in achieving the level of effective teacher (Lipshitz, Friedman, & Popper, 2006; Popper & Lipshitz, 1992).

A. Teacher Mentoring

Mentoring can be defined as a hierarchical relationship where the mentor is more experienced than the mentee, or the facilitator has or can provide the knowledge and skills needed and desired by the mentor (Aladejana, Aladejana, & Ehindero, 2006). Mentoring is a special mode of learning where the facilitator not only supports mentoring but also challenges them to make improvements (Smith, 2007). Mentoring in teacher education is as complex as building and negotiating mentoring between teachers and teachers in assisting students with a variety of professional goals and in responding to the factors they face (Fairbanks, Freedman, & Kahn, 2000).

Lai described the relationship between mentor and mentee in three-dimensional terms, namely relationships, development, and context. The relationship between a mentor and mentee must be a rational relationship. Development refers to how mentors and mentees develop personalities and professional qualities that lead to certain goals. Whereas the context means that the mentor and mentee focus on cultural characteristics and the mentor's regulatory situation. Lai writes that when three components occur, relationships occur and their impact on mentor relationships (Lai, 2005).

B. Mentor and Mentee Stereotypes

A mentor is a person in a leadership role suggesting assistance which is more similar to aspiration (Cox, 2005; Koki, 1997). However, the assistants have negative experiences rather than positive experiences in this type of relationship (Eby, McManus, Simon, & Russell, 2000). The research found negative mentoring because of a lack of mentor skills, and personality incompatibility was the main cause of negativity in mentoring relationships. Negative experiences can also occur in such a relationship, but careful matching of participants might exacerbate this problem (Bullough Jr et al., 2003). In the context of learning, coaching here often refers to peer coaching, which means assistance given from one teacher to another in developing teaching skills, strategies, or techniques in general in three formal structures: initial discussion, learning observation, and final discussion (Koki, 1997).

C. Role of Mentors from the Mentee Perspective

Various document sources from almost all over the world use focus, methodology, number of mentors and mentees, references and their respective roles (Ambrosetti & Dekkers, 2010):

The role of the mentor is very complex: as a supporter, role model, facilitator, assessor, collaborator, friend, trainer or teacher, protector, colleague, assessor and
communicator (Cherian, 2007). The role of mentor is complex and multifaceted (Hall, Draper, Smith, & Bullough, 2008). The important points are: (1) the role of the dynamic mentor, (2) the role of the mentor including aspects of the process and relationships, offers advice, and (3) based on the context, the mentor turns into an assessor after the practice of learning rather than the role of a friend.

D. Relationship between Mentor and Mentee

The role of the mentee is as one that plays an active role. Mentors are mutually beneficial relationships, so mentees have a balanced role with mentors (Walkington, 2005). Possible relationship between mentor and mentee can be seen in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The role of a mentor</th>
<th>The inherent role of mentee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Supporter</strong></td>
<td>Be open</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Listen to a mentor.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Implement advice and suggestions from mentors (Greene &amp; Puetzer, 2002)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Bring one's own perceptions and beliefs in their functional relationships (Walkington, 2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Change and develop perceptions and beliefs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Take risks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Friend</strong></td>
<td>Carry out the task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Implement tasks and actions in the work and learning environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Use guidance and support from mentors to guide how they carry out the task (Lai, 2005).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Be obliged to record and document the learning journey and make an outline of the goals achieved (Walkington, 2005).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Role model</strong></td>
<td>observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Observe how the task or action is completed by the mentor.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Make observation notes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Discuss observations to develop work-related skills and knowledge (Lai, 2005).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Reflect oral and written discussions that focus on self-study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Reflect personal practices for the development of experiences, goals, and aspirations (Lai, 2005).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Facilitator | active participant
---|---
- Take an opportunity to develop professional skills and knowledge.
- Initiate tasks to be completed.
- Become a volunteer for task performance.
- Create opportunities for participation (Walkington, 2005).

Reflection
- Reflect on one’s own performance tasks and actions.
- Discuss reflection with mentors for professional development and clarity of development (Lai, 2005)

carry out the task
- Make use of opportunities facilitated by mentors.
- Carry out tasks that can be scheduled or unscheduled (Kamvounias, McGrath-Champ, & Yip, 2007)
document self-development
- Be responsible for the development of self-learning.
- Set goals and achieve goals through facilitated opportunities.

Collaborator | work with others
---|---
- Share ideas through conversation and action.
- Plan, participate in performance implementation, come up with other ideas or assistance (Laker, Laker, & Lea, 2008)
- Initiate work opportunities with others.
- Be willing to participate in the sharing flow.
- Hear and carry out advice.

work in a role or task
- Take on a professional role and start carrying out work (Bullough Jr et al., 2003)

Assessor | execute the task
---|---
- Become familiar with assessment criteria and use criteria as guidelines for carrying out tasks (Bray & Nettleton, 2007).

carry out self-assessment
- Conduct critical reflection in order to make a self-assessment of the performance implementation
- Use feedback from mentors with critical reflection to determine self-development (Le Maistre et al., 2006).

Source: Ambrosetti and Dekkers (2010)

Regarding the explanation above, this paper aims to find out:
1) What problems do teachers face?
2) How does mentoring solve the problems?
METHOD

The authors applied the Margaret Riel Model action research consisting of studying and planning, taking action, collecting and analyzing evidence, and reflecting (Riel, 2010). This paper used three main categories of data collection techniques: are observation, interview, and document review and analysis (Mertler, 2018; Wallen & Fraenkel, 2013). Four teachers were involved in this mentoring which is carried out in three cycles. The four teachers recorded their learning activities using 1) an observation format sheet which is a mentoring format used as a record of teacher and student activities, 2) a flanders format sheet, which is a mentoring format used to check teacher and student activities per 5 minutes, 3) a the camera, used as an event recorder during learning which is useful for reinforcement if good practice and for correction, if practice is not correct, 4) five-step mentor format, this format is used, observers post observation.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The author presents the data of the mentoring process using Riel's action research model which includes 1) Learn and plan, 2) Take action, 3) Collecting and analyzing evidence, and 4) Reflect.

A. Cycle 1
1) Learn and plan
The mentor assigns the mentee to draw up a Lesson Plan (LP). The LP was checked using a checklist of pedagogical competency indicators for learning preparation up to ≥80% of the total indicators. It was agreed that the lesson plans were made first in draft form. Then at least one day before the lesson plan lesson is checked, the indicators are fulfilled and if necessary a discussion is held to improve the draft LP.

2) Take action
The mentor invited mentees to discuss while examining the mentee's understanding of the lesson plans she compiled. Then the mentor checks the LP with a checklist. The percentage achieved was 86.84%.

3) Collecting and analyzing evidence
Teacher learning practices were seen from the Flanders format, she could already carry out student-centered learning. Teacher behavior emerged in 17 emergent activities. The most dominant teacher activity is observing students doing assignments 7 times from the 44th minute to the 64th minute.

4) Reflect
Mentors needed to do the following: (1) Must be more thorough and check and re-check the mentee's understanding of basic competency to be achieved, (2) Ask the mentee the estimated comfort level of students in carrying out the learning, (3) Ensure the adequacy of the worksheet, (4) facilitating the conduct of attitude and skills assessment, (5) ensuring that the sharing technique of the mentee does not waste time, (6) practicing the technique of giving instructions, (7) ensuring the mentee understands and is skilled in using the chosen model, (8) Train mentees to do an analysis of how to work and student work or worksheet.

B. Cycle 2
1) **Learn and plan**

Teacher had agreed to focus on improvements to the technique of dividing the worksheet, managing students to be orderly in taking books, sensitivity to the comfort aspects of students doing activities so that the goals were achieved optimally, the game had not been well organized, has not appreciated students' wrong answers, and wrong in giving instructions that should make the question sentence, not make question words.

2) **Take action**

The mentor conducted a discussion the LP draft with her. The mentor checked the Lesson Plan using the learning preparation indicator checklist. Based on the checklist, fulfillment reached 89.47%.

3) **Collecting and analyzing evidence**

She had conducted student-centered learning; the teacher's behavior dominated in leading class discussions 6 times from the 36th minute to the 48th minute and the 56th minute to the 60th minute. Next was on observing students doing assignments acting as student mentors. The teacher's behavior appeared 6 times from the 20th minute to the 60th minute. The teacher's behavior helps students do the assignment. The behavior emerged from minute 20 to minute 36. Learning 1 in the second cycle was presented as follows. Based on checking the pedagogical competency checklist that the indicators that had been met 90.65%, she in the second cycle had exceeded the minimum 80%.

4) **Reflect**

Mentors did the following things, (1) ensure mentees use safe media, (2) remind mentees how to efficiently share LK, (3) ensure LK adequacy, (4) remind mentees to complete one activity before moving to the next activity, (5) Ensuring the adequacy of the media so that each student is involved, and (6) Sharing about behavior and product analysis.

C. **Cycle 3**

1) **Learn and plan**

Focus on mentoring the second cycle she chose unsafe media, distributed the worksheet still went around (even once), one group each consisting of 4 students up to 5 students was only provided one worksheet, and one activity had not been completely moved to another activity.

2) **Take action**

In the session checking the source of materials and tools found that there was one tool that was not yet available. The tool was a scale. After a deeper discussion about the unavailability of the scales because the school did not yet have it and the school must make a purchase. As a new teacher, there were psychological barriers to applying for owning scales. The mentor asked the mentee to calculate the funds needed to hold the scale. After calculating the funds needed, the mentor helped the mentee convince the school treasurer and the principal that the intended scale must be held. The mentor checked the fulfillment of the lesson plan as much as 89.47% of the indicators.

3) **Collecting and analyzing evidence**

The Flanders Format notes that the teacher had been able to carry out student-centered learning. The characteristic of student-centered learning was that time on task dominated learning activities. The time on task of students reached 28 appearances. Even if many teachers were recorded, the teacher performed the function as a facilitator or student learning mentor. Based on observations of the implementation of learning, she
still had not left a significant negative note. It's just that she didn't fully have confidence in Standard Competence understanding.

4) Reflect

Mentor was fully aware of the following matters, (1) Teacher's work is very dynamic and continues to change with changing times, (2) Teachers' understanding of basic competency still needs guidance, (3) Mentoring with special sessions of learning models centered on student learning, (4) More intensive dialogue is needed about the use of real media or realists available in the student environment.

D. Regarding research questions 1

The problems in cycle 1 to cycle 3 for each teacher, writer can be presented in the table as follows.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identified Problems</th>
<th>Causes of the Identified problems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Competency-based learning is not in line, competency-based assessment has not been done</td>
<td>Not fully understanding what is contained in the competency-based learning and assessment???? and unable to identify the competency based learning from what subjects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dividing worksheet by going around Students take books by grabbing</td>
<td>Not to think about the effective use of time Not to think about the effective use of time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When playing, students in group 1 and 2 are not as comfortable as group 3. Mountain tread play activities are not well organized Have not appreciated students' wrong answers</td>
<td>Not to take into account space so that activities run better</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instruct students to make question words</td>
<td>Tongue slip/wrong concept</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Cause</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Selection of unsafe media</td>
<td>Limited information and knowledge about tools and media that are safe for children to use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distributing worksheet is still going around even once</td>
<td>Not familiar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One group (4 students - 5 students) one worksheet</td>
<td>One group (4 students - 5 students) one worksheet before understanding how to maximize group function</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The activity of making shapes and two-dimensional spaces using stick media and plasticine has not yet been stated but to have moved to the activity of drawing shapes and flat spaces.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Cause</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of understanding the Competency Base of the subjects being taught</td>
<td>The new teacher factor, the class teacher has implications for the number of Competency Bases that must be understood. The teacher has not experienced the repetition of learning from the same Competency Base.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The problems that the authors present from tables 2 to 13 are those related to teacher's pedagogical skills which really determine student academic performance and determine effective classroom management (Khojastehmehr & Takrimi, 2009). Students learn more from teachers with skill characteristics, such as mastery of the material, know-how to design and deliver for diverse classes effectively (Wayne & Youngs, 2003). Pedagogical abilities have a reciprocal relationship with classroom management and student academic performance including assessment and assessment skills, mastery of information technology, and co-curricular knowledge (Chetty, Friedman, & Rockoff, 2014).

Teachers who have the ability to organize and manage student behavior will produce positive education graduates (Oliver & Reschly, 2007). Effective teachers are able to minimize classroom disruptive student behavior (Emmer & Stough, 2001). Students involved in the learning process show fewer behavioral problems and are more involved in responding and in correct responses in learning (Conroy, Sutherland, Snyder, & Marsh, 2008). Competition in healthy learning strengthens leadership and beneficial understanding between losers and winners (Hamid et al., 2012). The effectiveness of learning is influenced by the setting of the application of collaborative learning environment methods, so there is a dramatic increase in the student level by teachers who change the classroom environment each semester (Zapatero, Maheshwari, & Chen, 2012). Factors that motivate students to learn from their perspective find that the main factors are the teacher's personality, teaching methodology, positive classroom management (Halawah, 2011).

This mentoring activity is successful because mentoring is a mutual learning activity because the focus of the mentor is to help improve the teacher's ability to manage to learn. The mentor teacher has the greatest influence on the development of the teacher as a professional teacher. Knowledge, time, and involvement are needed to make meaningful experiences for the mentored teachers. Providing a climate of openness and honest discussion, questions, and attention will create an environment that allows reflection and development for both mentors and who are accompanied to achieve the level of teacher that is developing and success will be achieved (Lipshitz, Friedman, & Popper, 2006; Popper & Lipshitz, 1992). This mentor is meaningful because the
relationship between the roles of the mentor (as supporter, supporter, role model, facilitator, collaborator) and assessor can be carried out by both parties.

E. Regarding research questions 2

Tables 14 to 25 are the agreed efforts between the mentor and the mentees in solving the problems encountered.

**Table 5. Alternative solutions to Identified Problems for Teacher in Cycle 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alternative Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓ Join discussion about the contents of the competency base, preparing a joint Lesson Plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Require the group leader or group representative to take the worksheet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Pay attention to the comfort and fluency of learning activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Make rules or game steps: Prepare the whistle, determine the duration of play, and the order of making and returning to class.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Manage A more careful division of time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Make question sentences using question words.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 6. Alternative solutions to Identified Problems for Teacher Cycle 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alternative Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓ Re-check the use of tools and materials that are safe for students with straws instead of sticks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Implement further mentoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Give one worksheet one child even though get ideas and answers in groups, but per individual working on the worksheet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Declare every activity as having ended up moving</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 7 Alternative Solutions to Identified Problems for Teacher 1 Cycle 3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alternative Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓ Support to continue to create a comprehensive Lesson Plan.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The role of the mentee is as one who plays an active role. Because mentoring is a mutually beneficial relationship, the mentee has a balanced role with the mentor.
Mentors and mentees play their respective roles with the principle of mutual openness, humanistic relationships in high spirit, for example, accept input, convey technical and psychological issues, try out suggestions and determine joint proposals, and try them out in the frame of the relationship between the role of mentors as supporters, friends, role models, facilitator, collaborator, and assessor. While the role of the mentee is inherent, such as being open, carrying out tasks, documenting personal development, observers, reflecting, active participants, reflecting, carrying out tasks, documenting self-development, working with others, working in roles or tasks, executing tasks, and carrying out self-assessments.

CONCLUSION

To construct synthesis in the relationship between the needs of the mentor and mentee. The authors conclude that 1) teacher problems include pedagogical competence issues, personality competency, social competency, and professional competency, 2) Mentor is able to solve these problems through the ability of mentors in playing mentoring roles resulting in a good relationship between mentor and mentee. A good relationship between mentor and mentee enables the effectiveness of effective teacher outcomes.

REFERENCES


